

BOOK REVIEWS

Marilyn Fardig Whiteley, ed., *The Life and Letters of Annie Leake Tuttle: Working for the Best*. Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1999. 168 pp. \$29.95.

Martha M. Pickrell. *Emma Speaks Out: Life and Writings of Emma Molloy (1839–1907)*. Carmel, Indiana: Guild Press, 1999. 162 pp. \$24.95.

Dotted with issues such as temperance and female suffrage which led women across the North American continent to band together to make a difference in their communities, the 19th century serves as an important milestone in the women's rights movement. Annie Leake Tuttle and Emma Barrett Molloy were two such activists, and although their paths did not cross, both women stand as examples of personal dignity and self-reliance expressed through their unique gifts and ideas.

Although these women are not among the most well-recognized names of the Methodist tradition, both Tuttle and Molloy recognized the hand of Providence moving in their lives as they explored a number of diverse careers. Molloy worked as the first and only woman newspaper editor in northern Indiana, and as her popularity soon traveled beyond her home state she embarked on a highly successful career as a public speaker for the temperance movement and for women's rights. Working with the Women's Christian Temperance Union (WCTU), the Good Templars and the Ribbon Workers, Molloy traveled as far as England in her efforts to encourage sobriety and clean Christian living. In the twilight of her life, Molloy evangelized in Methodist churches on the west coast. Tuttle also pursued a number of occupations including that of school teacher, matron of a Chinese Rescue Home for the Methodist Women's Missionary Society (WMS), and stepmother. Born and raised in Nova Scotia, her work and her tireless devotion to her scattered family took her all over Canada and into the United States. After entering the Old Ladies' Home in Halifax at the age of 68, she continued to participate as a member of the WCTU, served as an organizer in the WMS, and voted in the first federal election in Canada after women secured suffrage.

Both Pickrell and Whiteley rely heavily on primary sources for their analysis of Tuttle and Molloy. Although few of Molloy's personal papers were recovered, Pickrell was able to construct a biography in the first half of the book based primarily on public record; the second half contains a variety of Molly's newspaper articles, speeches and sermons. In choosing from the vast quantity of material that Molloy published during her lifetime, Pickrell was guided by a dedication to represent the breadth of Molloy's life stages and styles, as well as the historical significance and authenticity of various pieces—not at all a straight-forward task since Molloy often

employed pen names. Pickrell also based her choices on the tastes of modern readers and excluded a number of pieces based on their length.

Whiteley, instead of dividing the primary and secondary sources, weaves into each chapter an introductory biographical segment followed by an excerpt from Tuttle's autobiography, occasionally supplemented by personal letters from the same time period. In the fifty-eighth year of her life, Tuttle began to record reminiscences of her childhood and early adulthood and continued this journal well into her eightieth year. She did not intend for these deeply personal memories to be published, but before her death she sent the journal to her favorite niece so that some history of the Leake family would be preserved. Whiteley was also able to recover a number of Tuttle's letters to other family members and friends.

In each of these volumes, important primary source documents have been made available which allow the reader to gaze at the hearts of two fascinating Methodist women and their struggles to make a place for their convictions.

NATASHA L. WHITTON
Madison, NJ

Blumhofer, Edith L., Russell P. Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker, eds. *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*. Chicago, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1999. 273 pp. Cloth, \$42.50, Paper, \$19.95.

This collection of essays offers perspectives from a variety of disciplines on the subject of Pentecostal—including charismatic—encounters with mainstream Protestant groups in the United States. While this scholarly diversity provides a good look at the different ways in which Pentecostalism is being studied, it also opens up healthy questions about how we understand and talk about Pentecostalism in particular and Protestantism in general.

Russell Spittler's essay opens the collection with a theological analysis of the Pentecostal movements' historical precedents in which he offers a critique of these movements' emphasis on the spirit over the body. The final essay by Augustus Cerillo is an invaluable historiographical survey of scholarship on what some scholars now call "classical" Pentecostalism. He also evaluates the recent work on the charismatic renewal movements.

It is this division between Pentecostalism and charismatic renewal movements that organizes the rest of the book. Part II contains four essays covering the early organizational years of the Pentecostal movement. The

essays include a survey of quarrels between Pentecostals and members of the Holiness movement, two case studies of Pentecostal organizing, and an analysis of early theological work among the Assemblies of God. Six essays in Part III cover a wide variety of encounters between charismatics and the Protestant mainstream, from the non-denominational Women's Aglow Fellowship to specific denominational case studies. A sociological survey of contemporary "Spirit-filled" movements in the United States offers a broad statistical view.

Nancy Eiesland's essay, "Irreconcilable Differences: Conflict, Schism, and Religious Restructuring in a United Methodist Church," describes the struggle of one Methodist congregation in northern Georgia with the charismatic movement. Her essay includes a short history of the United Methodist Renewal Service Fellowship and other charismatic church renewal organizations that have influenced United Methodism. She extends her analysis to discuss the challenges made by charismatic movements to the denomination at large.

Finding the edges of what constitutes Pentecostalism is the central tension that runs throughout the essays, and the juxtaposition of theological analyses with cultural conceptualizations highlights this tension. Several broad questions emerge: Is Pentecostalism primarily a theological or cultural/sociological category? What groups are "mainstream" now? Is the use of "mainstream" left over from outdated social and cultural configurations, or can the Methodists, Baptists, and Presbyterians still be discussed as a stable core of American Protestantism? While these questions are not addressed directly in this collection, its focus on encounters gives ample evidence that Pentecostal currents are no longer easily distinguishable from other American Protestant streams, and certainly do not run on the outside.

MORRIS L. DAVIS, JR.
Huntingdon, IN