BOOK REVIEWS


The study of the history of individual Pentecostal and Methodist national and regional denominations in Latin America is just beginning. This volume is devoted to the Pentecostal Methodist Church of Chile, an indigenous ecclesiastical body with historical ties to the Methodist Episcopal Church. It began under the influence of W. C. Hoover, who was appointed (1889) missionary to Chile by the quasi-independent "Self-Supporting Mission" established earlier by William Taylor (see D. Bundy, "Bishop William Taylor and Methodist Mission: A Study in Nineteenth Century Social History," *Methodist History*, 27 [1989], 197-210; 28 [1989], 3-21). The Taylor strategy of empowering converts to manage their own affairs and his policy of allowing missionaries on the field to determine their priorities and procedures were intentionally and systematically eroded by the Methodist Mission Board in favor of a more imperial model as was then current in North American mission theory (see William Hutchison, *Errand to the World: American Protestant Thought and Foreign Missions* [Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987]). Out of the conflict over mission theory and practice came the Iglesia Metodista Pentecostal. Unfortunately, the authors appear to be unaware of this history and interpret the development primarily as a theological crisis and the acceptance of the Pentecostal solution.

The volume begins by summarizing the history of North American missions in Chile (James Thompson, William Wheelwright, David Trumbull), but without demonstrating their relevance to the history of the denomination. However, chapters 2-7 describe the pre-Pentecostal ministry of Hoover and other eventual Pentecostal Methodist leaders and the initial controversies over glossolalia. The authors go on to describe (Ch. 8) the events surrounding the September 12, 1909, experiences of Elena (Helen) Laidlaw, providing helpful correctives to the version of J. T. Copplestone (*Twentieth-Century Perspectives [The Methodist Episcopal Church, 1896-1939]* [History of Methodist Missions, 4 (New York: Board of Global Ministries, 1973)], 589-610). The furor raised in the national press is described (Ch. 9-10) as well as the involvement of Hoover and others in the discussion. In response to the sensational press coverage (Ch. 11), the periodical *Chile Evangélico* (Sept. 11, 1909, to Nov. 2, 1910) was developed from the base of the Iglesia Presbiteriana de Conception (with a quotation on the masthead from John Wesley!). It served as an instrument of liaison between disparate elements of the developing Pentecostal movement, reported international Pentecostal developments, and promoted Pentecostal religious experience. It was succeeded by *Chile Pentecostal* on November 24, 1910, also published at Conception.
Chapters 12-16 describe the early development of the denomination. Particular attention is given to the expansion in the south, the organization of the Annual Conferences, and other administrative procedures as well as the leadership structures. This is followed by three chapters, actually appendixes (Ch. 16-19). The first of these reprints reports of the visit of A. B. Simpson to Chile published in Chile Evangélico (March 6 to April 6, 1909), the second reprints letters relevant to the resignation of W. C. Hoover from the Methodist Episcopal Church, and the third reprints the announcement of the formation of the Iglesia Metodista Pentecostal written by Hoover for publication in Chile Evangélico on June 9, 1910.

The volume makes several contributions to the historiography of Methodism and Pentecostalism. It narrates the events with extensive citations from original documents (ecclesiastical statements, correspondence, and periodicals), to which few in other parts of the world have access, and makes use of oral history interviews. It offers some correctives to Methodist accounts of the development of the denomination, but unfortunately without placing these events in the context of the larger Methodist mission experience in Chile during the period before 1909. Interaction with the earlier historical work of Copplestone (see above) and J. B. A. Kessler, A Study of the Older Protestant Missions and Churches in Peru and Chile (Goes: Oosterbaan & LeCointre, 1967), as well as the article of Walter Hollenweger ("Methodism's Past Is Pentecostalism's Present: A Case Study of Cultural Clash in Chile," Methodist History, 20 [1982], 169-182), would have been helpful. The volume is enhanced by the detailed table of contents, numerous photographic plates, and bibliography. Despite its historiographical problems, the volume will be a standard source for the history of Latin American Methodism and Pentecostalism.

David Bundy
Christian Theological Seminary


This is the magnificent culminating and crowning volume of a four-volume history of Methodism’s mother church, under the general editorship of Rupert Davies, A. Raymond George, and Gordon Rupp, who died shortly before its publication. It is essential reading for anyone who would understand the movement begun by John Wesley over two hundred and fifty years ago.

Perhaps “reading” is not the most apt word for the use of this large and necessarily expensive volume. Not even the most avid and enthusiastic student would plan to read it through, even in multiple sittings. It is
encyclopedic in approach, a volume for perusal upon hundreds of themes in the realms of history, theology, ecclesiology, worship, sociology, Methodist cult and culture. By its means we are able to pick up clues to the character, beliefs, and activities of hundreds of Methodists through two-and-a-half centuries, to read samples of their writings, to witness them in action, to see their style of living, their links with other churches and with the ecumenical movement, their problems, their successes and failures. Although every self-respecting Methodist library, whether of large church, college, or university, should own a copy, this is a volume for consulting in the studious home rather than glancing at in the library or borrowing for "a good read."

I'm not quite sure whether I should apologize for the abnormal length of this review, and the fact that at times it takes on something of the character of a "How to" manual, but if an apology is needed I must claim that when I first handled the volume I was somewhat intimidated, and felt that the potential reader needed to be assured from the outset that this was indeed a volume from which he could learn much, but that perhaps he would need some encouragement during the early stages of the learning process.

From the beginning of publication in 1965, the editors of this historical project envisaged a closing volume which would furnish its connecting arch, spanning the subjects covered by means of the essays in the three preceding volumes with "a collection of the primary documents which are needed for the further study of Methodist history, and a bibliography to cover the whole work." Limitations of space prohibit the inclusion of every primary document which might by many be considered essential, such as Wesley's *The Character of a Methodist* or *The Nature, Design, and General Rules of the United Societies*, but a widely representative selection. The general title of Part One, indeed—the bulk of the volume, comprising almost 650 pages—is "documents and source material." The source material incorporates masses of illuminating letters and diaries, such as one entitled "Shortcomings of the Early Itinerants" (p. 115), which is no less illuminating in spite of the fact that the holding library incorrectly labeled its author as Thomas Butts instead of "anonymous." The location of each extract is indicated, and brief introductory notes and an occasional editorial comment are supplied. The documents are sometimes abridged, with omissions indicated; punctuation and spelling are lightly modernized. They are presented chronologically in three divisions under the following headlines: 1. To the Death of John Wesley (5–237); 2. From 1791 to 1851 (238–494); 3. From 1851 to 1932 (495–649).

The extracts are sufficiently lengthy to be truly informative and representative of their theme and writer: this is by design no mere collection of purple passages. Dr. Vickers fairly states what he has felt unable to do:

Some topics, such as the development of Methodist architecture and the vast field of overseas missions, have only a token representation. Others are excluded altogether by editorial policy: notably, Calvinistic Methodism, which played a
significant part in the Evangelical Revival but has never been part of the British Methodist Church or its antecedents, and the period since 1932.

At the same time he points out the impossibility, even within these "imposed limitations," of doing any more than striking a series of balances within the large field covered. The amount of space allotted (as shown above) demonstrates that the eighteenth century won over later periods. Other balances had to be struck, however:

between . . . the connexional and the local, official policy and grassroots deviations, organisation and spirituality, controversy and piety, high Wesleyanism and Radical Methodist, and so on.

The editor continues:

Impressions and verdicts on Methodism from outside the Methodist fold provide alternative perspectives, whether Anglican, dissenting, or secular. But beyond this it has not here been possible to give any of the wider social and cultural background without which the rise and development of Methodism cannot be understood.

(It must be pointed out, of course, that the preceding volumes contain masterly chapters specifically relating Methodism to its contemporary setting in the three major eras, supplied respectively by Sir Herbert Butterfield and Professors W. Reginald Ward and Thomas E. Jessop.)

In order to be fair we must at least present a larger sampling of the titles of these sample documents, which range from one to several pages in length:

Kingswood School, 1749 (104-6);
The first Irish Conference, 1752 (113-14);
The Twelve Rules of a Helper, 1744-1753 (116-19);
"Reasons against a Separation from the Church of England," 1758 (128-34);
Women Preachers [letter, Mary Bosanquet to John Wesley, 1771] (168-71);
The Sunday Service of the Methodists, 1784 (200-01);
Charles Wesley, a retrospect of his life, April 1785 (204-06);
Dublin Methodism [Adam Clarke to John Wesley, 1790] (230-31);
Circuit Plan for Manchester, 1799 [facsimile] (298);
Music in Worship, 1805 (313);
The First English Camp Meetings, 1807 (316-19);
Female Itinerants in the Bible Christian Connexion, 1819-20 (361-62);
Sunday School Rules, Grimsby, 1820 (373-75);
On Primitive Methodism, a broadsheet [facsimile, c. 1820] (379);
Instructions to the Wesleyan Missionaries, 1825 (381-86);
The Leeds Organ Case, 1826 (396-97);
Anecdotes of Irish Missionaries [diary of Elijah Hoole], 1830 (410-11);
First Report of Wesleyan Educational Committee, 1837 (433-36);
The Mission to Fiji [letter from James Calvert], 1839 (453-55);
The 1849 Expulsions [leader in London Times, Sept. 3, 1849] (487-90);
The Census of Religious Worship, 1851 [extracts] (497-505);
The Class Meeting in Decline [Methodist Recorder, Nov. 10, 1865] (530-31);
Hints for Writers in Joyful News newspaper, 1883 (559-60);
Temperance and Total Abstinence [debate in Wesleyan Conference, 1901] (608-11);
The Deed of Union of the Methodist Church, 1932 [excerpts] (646-47).
A few illustrations are furnished, and a valuable though selective index at the end of the volume, which relates specifically to the documents and source material (831–38).

The Bibliography has its own apparatus and index, to which we now turn. The compiler, Dr. Clive Field, has been preparing and continuously updating a bibliography of Methodist historical literature for the *Proceedings* of the Wesley Historical Society since 1976. During more than a decade this has been enlarged, and then refined and reduced to about four and a half thousand items in accordance with principles similar to those governing the choice of documents dealing mainly with the British Isles at the connexional rather than the local level; they should preferably be published, over five pages long, and readily available in English, though without excluding significant older works, important unpublished works, and “key titles in Welsh, French, German, and other languages.”

A hierarchical system of classification enables all works to be identified by means of a sequence of four figures, and it is important that the reader should at the outset familiarize himself with the Table of Contents, pp. 656–662. He will find seven major categories and two appendices: 1. Long-term perspectives (i.e., general categories), 603; 2. John Wesley and Eighteenth-century Methodism, 673; 3. From the Death of John Wesley to Methodist Union (i.e., in 1932): Interdenominational Treatments, 743; 4. From the Death of John Wesley to Methodist Union: Wesleyan Methodism, 753; 5. From the Death of John Wesley to Methodist Union: Primitive Methodism, 777; 6. From the Death of John Wesley to Methodist Union: Other Traditions, 786; 7. Methodism from 1932, 796. Appendix I: Chapter Conversion Table (a summary of the chapter headings in the previous three volumes, converted to relevant three-digit bibliographical keys), 801; Appendix II: Index of Authors and Editors, 803–30, with their works identified by four-digit bibliographical keys.

Each of the major categories in the table of contents is divided into sub-categories (43 of them) and these in turn into sub-sub-categories (about 350). Then follows, from p. 663 onwards, the bibliography proper, after each three-digit classification, beginning thus:

1. LONG-TERM PERSPECTIVES (major category)
   1.1 Study Aids (sub-category)
      1.1.1. Bibliography and historiography (sub-sub-category)

Immediately below each sub-sub-category heading, with its three digits, appear the four-digit entries setting out the full bibliographical details of each relevant work, large or small, beginning with the author or title. Thus it is easily possible to turn to any theme or individual from the table of contents, and to any author from Appendix II.

A sample of a search in “2. John Wesley and eighteenth-century Methodism” could go like this. You might turn to sub-category “2.4 Spirituality: Theology—Sources of Authority,” or “2.5 Spirituality:
Theology—The Plan of Salvation,” or “Spirituality: the Church and the Means of Grace.” And you might then decide to examine the sub-sub-categories for 2.5, and find: “2.5.1 General Works / 2.5.2 Man’s fallen state / 2.5.3 God’s sovereign grace / 2.5.4 Christ’s atonement for sin / 2.5.5 Justification / 2.5.6 New birth and assurance through the Spirit / 2.5.7 Sanctification and perfection / 2.5.8 Eschatology.” Opposite each line you would find the page number where those bibliographical items began, under the bold-type heading. It is essential to remember, however, that it is useless to turn to the selective index at the end, even if “eschatology” were there, which it isn’t. Nor is there a subject index to the Bibliography. You would have to search the Table of Contents in order to find “2.5.8 Eschatology” on pp. 720–21. Here you would find five items, including Cyril Downes’s Edinburgh dissertation “Eschatological doctrines in the writings of John and Charles Wesley” (1960), and also a cross-reference to 2.2.10.8: “Ramage, Ian: Battle for the Free Mind (with special reference to John Wesley), London: George Allen & Unwin, 1967, 269.”

You might on occasion disagree with some details of the classification, and argue that the compiler should have located your desired theme elsewhere. Too bad! In the long run, however, you’ll probably agree that an extraordinarily tricky task has been carried out with real expertise, and accept Dr. Field’s assurance that “the framework which has been devised for use in this bibliography, after much careful research and pilot testing, is of a modular design which permits the constituent elements to be linked horizontally or vertically in any number of logical ways.”

I confess that at first I found this scheme of classification, with its resulting plethora of four-digit numbers, somewhat frightening. But once you know how it works you should find it relatively simple to operate, and will almost certainly discover many items of which you had never dreamed, now unearthed by the erudition and tireless labors of Dr. Field. Fortunately, we may add to it from time to time Supplements by Dr. Field himself, who has been preparing those annual lists of “Methodist Historical Literature” for every year since 1974. He has now produced the list for 1988, 149 items more conventionally arranged under 24 classifications, which even includes an analyzed breakdown of the essays in the 1988 Epworth Press volume of essays, John Wesley: Contemporary Perspectives. This was issued separately as a Supplement to the W.H.S. Proceedings, Part 4, for February 1990, 141–51. We trust that this new form of an old tradition may continue for the benefit of Methodist historians everywhere.

FRANK BAKER
Durham, NC
We are not only grateful for the books about John Wesley's life and thought which continue to be published, but also for those which contain the texts of Wesley's own publications. Here are two additions to the latter category.

Schoenhals' volume is a reprint of Wesley's Notes on the Bible (1987). It is an abridgment of Wesley's commentary on the Old and New Testaments. In the interest of space Schoenhals has eliminated the biblical text. He has, however, included selected comments by Wesley on each book of the Bible. In the process he has modernized Wesley's spelling and language, included something from every chapter of every biblical book, and quoted in full selected comments. Schoenhals has also chosen to record every note in which Wesley commented autobiographically, underscored doctrinal emphases, and made pastoral references. This book will not be useful for the critical scholar because it is not an edition of the original text, partial or complete. However, it is useful for inspirational reading and gives an adequate picture of Wesley's insights (many of which he borrowed from other sources) into scripture.

Betty M. Jarboe, editor of John and Charles Wesley: A Bibliography (1987), has put together a most interesting collection of quotations in her new volume. It is unusual in that it includes not only carefully selected quotes from John and Charles Wesley, but also several from their parents and their brother, Samuel. The quotations have been arranged by topic, and there is a very helpful index of keywords which makes the collection even more usable. Furthermore, each quotation is accompanied by a complete reference to its source. In collections of this kind one can always argue about what has been omitted. On the whole, however, Jarboe has done an excellent job of selecting significant comments of the Wesleys. This book will be useful to anyone who wants a handbook of such quotes.

CHARLES YRIGOYEN, JR.
Madison, NJ
**John Wesley and Christian Antiquity**, by Ted A. Campbell. Examines the thought of John Wesley against the background of classical and Christian revivalism in the 18th century. Ted Campbell shows how “classical antiquity” had become a focus of controversy in British religious conflicts of the mid-17th century, as well as a source of renewal for the Church in the later 17th century. He argues that Christian antiquity functioned for Wesley as an alternative cultural vision for religious renewal, much as classical antiquity served as a cultural model for secular Enlightenment thinkers of the 18th century. Campbell sees Wesley as a complex figure who consciously sought cultural change by appealing to his own culture’s most distinctive roots. A01 CA1-204321. Paper, $18.95

The Works of John Wesley—Volume 20: Journals and Diaries III (1743-1754), edited by W. Reginald Ward and Richard P. Heitzenrater. This is the third volume of Wesley’s journal to appear in the critical edition of The Works of John Wesley. Covering the period from late 1743 through 1754, it contains four “Extracts” from Wesley’s Journal (6-9) which document, in Wesley’s own words, an important period of expansion and organization in the Wesleyan revival. In vivid detail, Wesley describes the spread of the Methodist movement in the north and west of England, as well as its beginnings in Ireland and Scotland. The period also is marked by Wesley’s theological controversies with the established church. A01 CA1-462231. Cloth, $49.95

Charles Wesley: Poet and Theologian, edited by S T Kimbrough. Written by a distinguished group of contributors, this collection of essays makes possible a renewed appreciation of the theological and literary significance of the writings of Charles Wesley. Charles Wesley: Poet and Theologian contains the best, most up-to-date work on Wesley, based on recent historical, theological, and literary study of his writings, both poetry and prose, by members of The Charles Wesley Society. A01 CA1-?????. Paper, $18.95

The Unpublished Poetry of Charles Wesley, Vol. III: Hymns and Poems for Church and World, edited by S T Kimbrough and Oliver A. Beckerlegge. This is the third volume of a three-volume edition of all the previously unpublished poetry of Charles Wesley. This third volume presents verse on themes relating to the church and the world, some of particular relevance for understanding the historical and theological development of Methodism during the 18th century. The three volumes of The Unpublished Poetry of Charles Wesley are the first the 13 volumes of George Osborn’s The Poetical Works of John and Charles Wesley (London, 1868-1872). A01 CA1-433126. Paper, $24.95

Also available:
The Unpublished Poetry of Charles Wesley, Vol. II CA1-433096. $22.95
The Unpublished Poetry of Charles Wesley, Vol. I CA1-43310X. $15.95

Prices subject to change. Add your state’s sales tax. Add 8% for transportation (minimum $2.50). Satisfaction guaranteed!

Order from your local bookstore or call toll free 1-800-672-1789. Mail orders to: 201 Eighth Avenue South, P.O. Box 801, Nashville, TN 37202-0801.