Methodist History, 58:1 & 2 (October 2019 & January 2020)

CAMPING MISSIOLOGY: CAMPING TO PROMOTE HOLINESS AND MISSIONS

Robert K. Lang'at

Encampment for spiritual renewal was the hallmark of Methodism and its frontier missionary endeavors in the American colonies. As these camp meetings grew to be a major spiritual phenomena in American Methodism, their spiritual impetus generated a wide array of missionary engagements, both within the official church as well as the various other new outgrowths from mainline Methodism. But while the holiness missionary activities of the antebellum were largely independent and "unorganized," post Civil War American revivals, and indeed holiness revivalism internationally, entered an institutionalizing phase that was evident in the proliferation of missionary organizations. The evangelical missionary movement should, therefore, be seen as one aspect of the growing array of holiness institutions, in the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century, such as holiness evangelists, holiness periodicals, holiness meetings, holiness mission agencies, holiness churches, holiness schools, and holiness camp grounds. In essence, the evangelical missionary movement became the "foreign arm "of these American institutions.

Of the 63 camp meetings listed for the year 2001, on *The Camp Meeting Challenge*, an annual bulletin published by the Christian Holiness Partnership (formerly National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness), approximately half of them (28) listed Missions as a major part of their programs for the year. This is indicative of the crucial role camp meeting revivalism has played in shaping the evangelical missionary movement. The history of this relationship dates back to the days of that maverick Methodist missionary Bishop William Taylor. When he organized the 1866 revivals in South Africa, it was just a year before the holiness forces organized themselves into two major institutions. The first one of these was the National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness (NCMAPH) at Vineland, New Jersey, in 1867. A study of these encampments in relation to missions reveals initial tensions between "holiness speciality" and the missionary movement. When those tensions were overcome, an intimate relationship developed between the camp meetings and the emerging Reformed-leaning faith missions, the emergence of missionary spokespersons, and finally with the theological motivation and spiritual qualification for missionaries.

History of Camping and Camp Grounds

The history of camping and camp grounds, though heavily debated by

historians, can be dated back to religious practices that predate the Methodist revivals of eighteenth-century England. The flowering of this into a distinctive American experience, however, can be seen throughout the nineteenth-century growth of Protestant Christianity throughout the colonies. James McGready, a Presbyterian minister from Logan County organized a very successful series of camp meetings at Cane Ridge in 1801.

The Methodists, both in America and England, however, perfected the use of camp meetings beyond any other denomination in modern history. Most of these encampments are now either owned by The United Methodist Church (UMC) or related Wesleyan/Pentecostal denominations. These outdoor religious meeting, in the earlier days of American occupation, fitted so well as a way of reaching out with the gospel during the settler periods of the American frontier. In the non-western world, where the Methodist missionaries established work, these encampments were also contextualized to fit the new "foreign frontiers." For instance, the Methodist missionaries in Angola established a huge grass-thatched tabernacle in Quessua.

Camp meetings served where there were no churches, fewer ordained ministers, and limited means of transportation. These special meetings shaped the religious practices of the New World. The groves and the clearings in the middle of forests provided a serene environment for communion with God and nature. Families would move close to the encampments as if vacationing and would settle down to hear itinerant preachers, music and lively testimonies. The Methodists in America, as early as 1803, had organized camp meetings in Shoulderbone Creek in Hancock County, Georgia. Hollow Rock Holiness Camp Meeting Association in Ohio, which is still running today, dates back to 1815 when it was established by J. M. Bray, Pastor of Sugar Grove Methodist Episcopal Church. A similar trend is traceable in English Methodism and can be traced all the way to Mow Cop Camp Meeting of 1807. Other early Methodist camp meetings include Balls Creek (1853) and Ocean Grove Camp Meeting Association (1869), which came to be known as "Queen of the Victorian Methodist Camp Meetings."

It was within this context that John Stewart, the founder of missionary outreach to the Native Indians, was called. His life was turned around during a Methodist camp meeting, and he heard a strong voice telling him: "declare my counsel faithfully." From that agonizing experience, he was commissioned as a missionary to Native Indians in 1819.

Under the leadership of John S. Inskip as president and William McDonald serving as vice-president, the National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness was formed in Vineland, New Jersey on June 13, 1867. It is largely due to the inspiration and influence of these new efforts that several national and regional networks of holiness associations were formed throughout the United States. This paper particularly focuses, therefore, on the larger influence of this Methodist experience within the holiness movement after the 1867 events in Vineland, New Jersey, which in essence were further developments from the earlier Methodist undertakings. An understanding of this unlocks not only the emergence of the splinter Wesleyan

holiness groups out of the larger mainline Methodism but also the forces that continued to shape, albeit from within, the Methodist missionary endeavors and perhaps what may inform a better understanding of the evangelical character of global Methodism.

Holiness Specialization and Missionary Resistance

The inclusion of the missionary agenda in Wesleyan holiness encampments had untidy beginnings. From the inception of the National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness (hereafter NCMAPH) in 1867, it took about forty years before its missionary department was organized. These "special" holiness meetings were bound to be narrowly defined and lose a comprehensive holiness theology that was meant to demonstrate the expansive and boundless love of God. This writer's contention here agrees with Andrew F. Walls' view that foreign missions were not initially at the top of the agenda of the revivalists; they came later and were at best "an autumnal child of the Evangelical Revival."[1] While it is obvious that holiness institutions needed more time to attain stability and that they were actually indirectly supportive of missions during their formative stages,[2] it should be acknowledged that, initially, promotion of anything other than holiness during the encampments was considered a departure from their primary objective.

The minutes of the National Holiness Association (NHA), the successor of NCMAPH, of August 18, 1910 carried a motion with a resolution "that the public presentation of schools and colleges as well as all causes other than the preaching of Scriptural Holiness [is] to be forbidden on the Campground." A more extended prohibition made it clear that promotion of holiness was the only reason for which these highly focused camp meetings existed, "not temperance, missions or any other good Christian cause." These leaders, as Kenneth O. Brown has put it, ". . . felt that the mission of camp meeting would be compromised if they permitted the encampment to be used for any other purpose than the promotion of Scriptural holiness."

Yet, this was not as naive an anti-missionary objection as it might have casually appeared to be. Brown has also correctly pointed out that apart

---

[1] Brown, Kenneth O. *Holy Ground: A Study of the American Camp Meeting* (New York: Garland, 1992).

Wall's views must, however, be understood within his overall argument that when missions found a secure place in the revivals of the eighteenth century, these meetings "clarified the rationale for the missionary movement" and "without the revivals, the [missionary] societies would have been inconceivable." This is precisely where our current study will eventually lead to. See Andrew F. Walls, *The Missionary Movement in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission of Faith* (New York: Orbis Books, 1996), 79; also as an article "The Evangelical Revival, the Missionary Movement, and Africa," in *Evangelicalism: Comparative Studies of Popular Protestantism in North America, the British Isles, and Beyond, 1700–1990*, eds. Mark A. Noll, David W. Bebbington, and G. A. Rawlyk (New York: Oxford UP, 1994), 310.

[2] The role of the Keswick holiness and Wesleyan holiness, in promoting world missions even before the inclusion of missions in their encampment programs, should never be understated or made contingent only to emergence of official missionary organizations within their quarters.

from the fact that "the leaders of the camp meetings emphasized the promotion of the doctrine and experience of holiness as the sole mission of the camp meeting," at the heart of it was an ecclesiastical question. A number of Methodists within the holiness ranks did not want to be seen as sectarian as far as the church question was concerned. They were out to support missions of the church's missionary board rather than of the "independent" agencies. This was the dilemma that would become evident among holiness missionary leaders such as Iva Durham Vennard and H. C. Morrison, when this initial reluctance had been overcome.[3]

Holiness Theology and Missionary Motivation

A study of spiritual biographies of a significant number of evangelical missionaries of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century reveals an amazing similarity of pattern where conversion, sanctification, and calling to missionary service followed each other sequentially.[4] In 1906, Oswald Chambers, who wrote one of the most popular devotionals, *My Utmost for His Highest* and who was a great friend of Japanese holiness evangelist Juji Nakada "after the time of great spiritual crisis at Dunnoon," received his "baptism of the Holy Spirit" under the ministry of an English Baptist holiness evangelist, F. B. Meyer. In 1907, Chambers and Nakada were keynote speakers during holiness revival services at God's Bible School in Cincinnati, Ohio. He later went to Japan under the invitation of Nakada to preach to "his pastors." The subsequent step in the life of Chambers was a calling to be a missionary with the YMCA and Egypt General Mission at Zeitoun where he served until his death in 1917.[5]

The spiritual crisis that led to the holiness experience among missionaries also led to the calling to missions. This "exchanged life," as Hudson Taylor

---

[3] Kenneth O. Brown, *The History of Indian Spring Holiness Camp Meeting: A History of the Greatest Camp Meeting in the South* (Hazleton: Holiness Archives Publishing, 2000), 100, 208. For Morrison's role in world evangelism and caution on breaking away from the Methodist Episcopal Church's official missionary structures, see H. C. Morrison, *World Tour of Evangelism* (Louisville: Pentecostal Publishing, 1911).

[4] See Annie Eubanks, *These Went Forth: Short Biographical Sketches of Pilgrim Holiness Missionaries* (Indianapolis: Foreign Missions Department of Pilgrim Holiness Church, n.d.), as an example of biographical sketches of the members of the Pilgrim Holiness Church, where missionaries are reported to have experienced sanctification, which was then followed by a missionary calling.

[5] In fact, the aspirations exemplified by the title of this book carried with it the deepest commitment to a life of holiness and sacrifice. Missions were the ultimate demonstration of those commitments. See posthumous publication of Oswald Chambers' *My Utmost for His Highest* (Westwood, NJ: Barbour, 1963). Also David W. Lambert, *Oswald Chambers: The Man and the Message Behind My Utmost for His Highest* (Minneapolis: Bethany House Publishers, 1997), 33–59. Though a Baptist in spiritual background, Oswald Chambers was greatly influenced by a Methodist preacher, Dinsdale T. Young, who wrote in a foreward to his biography that he "never knew holiness assume a sweeter form than in" Chambers. See Biddy Chambers, *Oswald Chambers: His Life and Work* (London: Simkkin Marshall, 1941), 9. A more recent and exhaustive study of Oswald Chambers is David McCasland's *Oswald Chambers: Abandoned to God: The Life Story of the Author of* My Utmost for His Highest (Grand Rapids: Oswald Chambers Publications Association, 1993).

termed it, gave the faith missionaries the necessary "courage they needed for dangerous 'inland' missions and the humility, trust, and usefulness they required to serve with agencies that directed their lives but did not guarantee their salaries." Though Joel A. Carpenter, an evangelical scholar, has delineated ". . . the classic missionary motivations of the past century" from the motivations of those in the nineteenth century who added "consecration" to their motives for going for missions, it could be argued that these seem to be further developments along the pietistic leanings that had been established earlier rather than additions. This writer, nevertheless, agrees with him that this theme of "yielding" or higher life became significant for recruiting missionaries in the later half of the nineteenth century. It was understood as "a logical outcome of a life fully yielded to God" and, as a matter of fact "could be an important sign of and seal of a person's full surrender."[6]

The Methodist encampments were instrumental for expanding missions within these religious festivals. Cilicia Lovina Cross, who ended up as a missionary with the Methodist Episcopal Church in Angola, is an excellent example of the role of holiness in expanding and clarifying missionary world vision. On the front page of her autobiography, a summary list of key dates of her life is given: "Born 1887, Converted 1899, Sanctified 1908, CEI [Chicago Evangelistic Institute] 1910, Africa 1914, Retired 1952, Died 1963." This clearly demonstrates the order of major events in Cross' life that culminated in a call to Africa.

Her sanctification experience came as a result of a special service held by a pastor whose "consecration and spiritual liberty had led him to sell his farm and enter the ministry in the middle of life." This pastor had preached, according to Cross, "the Wesleyan doctrine of full salvation," and on hearing it, Cilicia Cross went to the altar to make full consecration and as a result she became "completely in love with Jesus" that she wanted only "to please Him and serve Him wherever, and however, she could. She waited only for His leading." When Dr. Morrison called for deaconesses, preachers or missionaries to be called from that local church meeting, Lovina answered "Yes, Lord and let me be one of them."

She attended her first camp meeting at Jamestown, North Dakota. It was there that her call to the Christian service was made clear. She wanted "to go to a school where the doctrine of holiness of heart and life was emphasized. She was introduced to Dr. Durham Vennard's School, Chicago Evangelistic Institute, by a deaconess who had graduated from CEI. Cross, who "knew little about Christian work for women except deaconess work" was introduced to what she termed "bigger things" at CEI. Contact with many of Dr.

---

[6] Andrew Porter, "Late Nineteenth-Century Anglican Missionary Expansion: A Consideration of Some Non-Anglican Sources of Inspiration," in *Religious Motivation: Biographical and Sociological Problems for the Church Historian,* ed. Derek Baker (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978), 358–359, as cited by Joel A. Carpenter, "Propagating the Faith Once Delivered: The Fundamentalist Missionary Enterprise, 1920–1945," in *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880–1980*, eds. Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1990), 119.

Vennard's graduates working in many countries around the world meant the missionary horizons were going to beckon on her. It was eventually a letter from Emma Nourse, a missionary in Africa that drove the message home for Lovina to accept a missionary call to Africa. In her own words, she stated, ". . . a great love for Africa and her people was poured into my heart." She connected this to her sanctification, saying, "that love which came to me when I made the forever and ever surrender was proof positive to me that He was truly leading me toward Africa."[7]

Thus, within a short time she had moved from a revival meeting in a small church, to a larger camp meeting, to yet a larger holiness school and, eventually, to the world, with every step enlarging her world vision. It was the surety of this foundation and calling that enabled her to go through "the disappointments, difficulties, discouragements, loneliness, and African fevers."[8] A holiness agency, too, was in place to recruit her into the field. She was, therefore, accepted by the WFMS in 1912, an organization in support of holiness missions, and was commissioned by Bishop Stuntz in 1913 to Loanda, Angola.

What was evident in the lives of individual missionaries was also part of a general trend of changing theological rationales in evangelical missions. It was in a similar light that we have to account for "the Cambridge seven," the student-led special services at Princeton that sent Robert McQuilkin to Africa. These were part of the ways through which the "new" holiness movement successfully tried to infiltrate classical educational institutions in a bid to inject a pietistic world-view to their orthodox theological agenda.

Holiness Missions as Revivalist Outlets

The institutional networks precipitated by the holiness revivals produced various inter-related outlets that often converged within the missionary arena to produce powerful symbiotic relationships between the holiness camp meetings and the mission fields. In subsequent years, missionary meetings or a "Missionary Day" became a prominent part of holiness camp meetings. As much as they inspired many into the mission fields, they also provided survival avenues for the holiness encampments and their institutions by opening up a "channel of expression" that prevented the stagnation of the movement.

It was at these encampments too, where the western world came to be informed in a particular way about the non-western world. The mental pictures carried from these meetings determined, to a large extent, both the kind of missionary candidates that would go to the "dark" world and the nature of their attitude once in the field.

The nature of raising support for missionaries was also, subsequent-

---

[7] Cilicia L. Cross, *Autobiography of Cilicia Lovina Cross*, The Withey Collection, The United Methodist General Commission on History and Archives, Drew University, Madison, New Jersey, 1–3.

[8] Cross, 1–3.

ly, transformed. What used to be "independent" or "self-support" during Taylor's formative years became "faith missions," a phenomenon which was not true only of the late nineteenth century independent and interdenominational holiness missions but of many within classical missions. A sanctified life implied the ultimate sacrifice of trusting God in faith to provide for the ultimate sacrifice of missions. This, perhaps, explains to some extent the rationale behind the NCMAPH's reluctance during the early days to use holiness camps for raising missionary funds. Missionaries were not to solicit funds but prayer support, and their involvement at the camp meetings was more to inspire and inform rather than to raise funds. The realities of life, however, demanded that these camp meetings were to be transformed in order to raise the much-needed funds for a new type of missionary: the holiness missionary.

The earliest institutional efforts within the holiness movement to harness the revivalist spirituality and resources for missions, can be seen in the relationship between William Taylor and the unfolding of the WFMS within the Methodist Episcopal Church. One of the first "organized" efforts to place the experience of holiness within a missionary context appeared within the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society (hereafter WFMS) of the Methodist Episcopal Church.[9] This agency was formed in 1869, just two years after the NCMAPH had been organized, at Vineland, New Jersey. While there are a number of women's concerns that demanded a unique feminist critique of the motivation behind the women's involvement in missions during this time, it is important to note the inception of the WFMS as part of the larger process of institutionalization and provision of survival outlets for the holiness movement.

The American Methodist women's missionary spirit was born out of the revival movement. Thus, as Dana L. Robert writes, "a forgotten aspect of their work was the extent to which holiness thought and spirituality shaped the WFMS during its first quarter century." A number of marks indicate the centrality of holiness in the WFMS. The language of consecration, confidence and self-sacrifice for missions, founding leaders being either sanctified or open to the experience among others, the raising of finances and recruiting sanctified missionaries from the holiness camp meetings, incorporation of

---

[9] Dana L. Robert's monumental study of American women in mission is, perhaps, the most cogent study, so far, that helps with a more precise feminist analysis of this period. Her article more clearly articulates the role of the holiness experiences in the women of WFMS' motivation for missions. Respectively, see *American Women in Mission: A Social History of Their Thought and Practice* (Macon: Mercer UP, 1997), and "Holiness and the Missionary Vision of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1869–1894," *Methodist History* 39.1 (October 2000): 15–27. Rhodesia (currently Zimbabwe) had the largest WFMS work in Africa by 1908. It is, thus, not surprising that it was also within this context that the Rukwadzano movement arose; Joseph Hartzel, *Forward Movement in Africa: The Quadrennial Report of the General Conference of 1908* (New York: Africa Diamond Jubilee Commission Board of Foreign Missions of the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1908), 11; and Joseph Hartzel's pamphlet, "Women's Work in Africa: Africa Diamond Jubilee" (New York: Africa Diamond Jubilee Commission, 1908).

the doctrine of holiness in their evangelistic work abroad, and support of the maverick holiness world evangelist William Taylor were all clear indicators that "the experiences of holiness or sanctification were a major factor" in the founding and self-perpetuation of the WFMS.

Mary Sharpe, who served as missionary under the WFMS in Liberia as of 1879, believed that "God has power on earth not only to forgive sins, but that the blood of Jesus Christ his Son cleanseth us from all sin." Mrs. William Butler attended Sing Sing and Ocean Grove camp meetings to promote the WFMS. At the former, she met Harriet B. Skidmore, of the Five Points Mission, whom she recruited for the cause and the latter became the secretary for the New York branch of the WFMS, serving in that position until her death in 1904.[10]

Apart from the WFMS and other women-related agencies, a more inclusive trend took place within the NCMAPH. Within these circles, by 1911, there was a general feeling that holiness evangelism had never been meant to be confined to America and that it was "not too radical a statement to make, to say that the vitality of the work at home demands the widening of our borders." It was essentially pointed out that "[a]s surely as the foreign fields need holiness, the holiness movement at home needs missions." In order to demand a mandatory holiness for the new Christians in heathen lands, the argument was laid out that "If the promotion of holiness is important among the people in a Christian land it is imperative for the converts from heathenism." It was out of this rationale that the National Holiness Missionary Society (hereafter NHMS) was conceived in 1910 as the official missionary mouthpiece of the Wesleyan-holiness encampments.

At the advent of the twentieth century, William Taylor and Amanda B. Smith, both of whom had carried the banner of Wesleyan holiness in missions retired from active missionary service. They represented a generation of maverick holiness missionaries that operated with loose attachment to their denominations.[11] The longing for the holiness people to have their own mission agency was intensified by the need to have a means of accountability. Finally, following the missionary principles established by Taylor, an interdenominational Wesleyan holiness faith mission, the NHMS, was founded in 1910.

Iva Durham Vennard, whose missionary vision, like that of Cilicia Cross, involved an ever-widening spiral as she got involved in the holiness movement. An active member of the WCTU, inspired by Lucy Rider Meyer of

---

[10] See Mary S. Wheeler, *First Decade of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, with Sketches of its Missionaries* (New York: Phillips & Hunt, 1881), 323. See Clementina Butler, *Mrs. William Butler: Two Empires and the Kingdom* (New York: Methodist Book Concern, 1929), 112–115. The WFMS definitely incorporated the holiness themes in assisting Pandita Ramabai to inspire Indian child widows "to holy and useful lives" (Helen B. Montgomery, *Western Women in Eastern Lands: An Outline Study of Fifty Years of Woman's Foreign Missions* [New York: Macmillan, 1910], 224–226).

[11] Nathan O. Hatch, *The Democratization of American Christianity* (New Haven: Yale UP, 1989), 214–215.

the Chicago Training School, Vennard was appalled by controversies surrounding the Wesleyan world while serving as a deaconess at Buffalo, New York. At one point she remarked, "O Lord, please let me go to Japan or Africa, or anywhere rather than to this burned-over territory, among prejudiced and stiff-necked people."[12] She, therefore, became a force behind two major interdenominational Methodist organs: the Chicago Evangelistic Institute (CEI—currently Vennard College in Iowa) and the NHMS. The founding of CEI was thus partly to channel the holiness resources within Methodism for overseas mission works. It is no surprise, then, that Vennard had wished that:

> . . . the Methodist church could have kept both the NHA and its missionary department within her denominational borders… for nearly all leaders in both institutions were Methodists who would have gladly turned all this spiritual force for the good and wealth of the denomination.

Regretfully, Vennard's hopes were not granted and, thus, CEI and NHMS, her twin projects, were organized as interdenominational projects, structured with Methodist organization and doctrines, as she said, as "true Methodists . . . according to basic Methodist patterns."[13]

This study calls attention to a further development within holiness revivalism which had been sustained by semi-church related camp meetings. That is, they were then moving in the direction of building strictly holiness foundation for their new missionary undertakings. Yet, there is a sense in which these additional sanctificationist outlets added global dimensions to the already well-established local media. It was on this holiness theological base that one can determine an emerging new spiritual experience mandated for the missionaries, a new theological rationale for holiness world evangelization, a method for revitalizing missionaries who were already in the field, and a new holiness discourse to explain the nature of the sins and the remedy for those living in "darkness," particularly those living in the "dark continent."

During the camp meeting business session meeting, of June 4, 1910, the NHAPH decided to form a missionary association that was to "have the first claim of the National [Holiness] Association." Those in attendance recognized the fact that though the NHA had encouraged "various other holiness missions on denominational and independent lines elsewhere, including China, Japan, Korea, Africa, India and regions beyond," and though most of these were perhaps "direct or indirect products of the National [Holiness Association] and they were preaching "a gospel of full salvation," there was still room for an official missionary department from NHA. As soon as it was formed, it was well on its way with "assurance of faith for the spread of holiness in China."[14] From then on, it understood itself as the official mis-

---

[12] Mary E. Bowie, *Alabaster and Spikenard: The Life of Iva Durham Vennard, D. D. Founder of Chicago Evangelistic Institute* (Chicago: Chicago Evangelistic Institute, 1947), 41–56.
[13] Bowie, 174–176.
[14] Mary A. Hill, "Letter to Friends," December 19, 1910, Christian Holiness Association Collection, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky.

sionary bureau of the NHA.[15]

James R. Bishop, the Executive Director of the WGM (formerly NHMS) in the 1960s wrote that "though keen missionary interest existed and scattered support was given to various missionaries and missionary projects through the National [Holiness Association] prior to June, 1910, . . . the leaders of the National [Holiness Association] were not satisfied with the haphazard expression of the organization's missionary zeal." A number of their missionaries who were involved with mainline Methodism and other missions were not finding what the holiness people called "an unhindered field for the aggressive pushing of holiness." Those missionaries operating independently had no system of accountability; thus the need for a distinctive holiness mission agency supported by Wesleyan encampments. The story of the Oriental Missionary Society (OMS) is also traceable to these logics.[16] These holiness missions also served another growing need within the holiness movement of providing a transitional place between mainline denominational and independent faith ecclesiastical bodies.

To some extent the much more globally influential events of Azusa Street Mission, which gave birth to Pentecostalism in 1907, cannot be understood without studying the spiritual tone that had been set by holiness revivalism at the Peniel Missions that had dotted the American west coast. The often-embattled Frank Bartleman, whose westward spiritual journey took him from the Baptist ministry in Pennsylvania, through a Wesleyan Methodist pastorate, through Pillar of Fire Ministries in Colorado, to finally serve with the Peniel Missions in both Sacramento and Los Angeles is a great example of this transition. Bartleman saw his work as beyond "salvation," and thus for him, "While souls had been saved during . . . the meetings in Peniel Mission . . . the greatest victory was the digging out of a company of young men." It was here where key Pentecostal leaders such as Edward Boehmer, Amil Allen and Orville Tingle came under his influence. He called them "Peniel boys," and the late night prayer meetings for revival at Peniel Hall were the forerunners of the Azusa Street outpourings of the latter days.[17] But for our

---

[15] For the clarification of the relationship between the National Holiness Association and the National Holiness Missionary Society see the pamphlet, "Relationship Between NHA and NHMS," Christian Holiness Association Collection, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore Kentucky.

[16] Iva Durham Vennard, "Is the National Association for the Promotion of Holiness Justifiable in Organizing a Department of Foreign Missions?" in *Christian Witness and Advocate of Bible Holiness* (June 15, 1911): 4.

[17] Frank Barleman, *Azusa Street: The Roots of Modern-day Pentecost* (Plainfield: Logos International, 1980), 1–42. A significant reprint which contains some of his works and life as an international evangelist is that edited by Donald W. Dayton, *Witness to Pentecost: The Life of Frank Bartleman* (New York: Garland Publishing, 1985). This volume contains works, by Bartleman, such *as From Plow to Pulpit: From Maine to California*, *How Pentecost Came to Los Angeles*, *Around the World by Faith with Six Weeks in the Holy Land*, and *Two of Years Mission Work in Europe Just before the World War.* This volume is also interspersed with various references to Peniel Mission. The influence of Welsh revivals, Pandita Ramabai's revivals in India, John Wesley and John Fletcher's holiness theology are very evident in Bartleman's theology in transition. He also read the life of the eclectic Methodist revivalist, Lorenzo Dow, who introduced American-style camp meetings in England.

specific holiness missiological interest in this study, one can simply note that FAIM, the AIM, the NHMS, and the Christian and Missionary Alliance, had some links to the Peniel Missions.[18]

Conclusion

Little did the revivalists that met in New Jersey in 1867 to found the National Camp Meeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness (NCMAPH) know that they were establishing a powerful missionary tool. It is, therefore, argued in this article that after the "small-scale," "unorganized," independent missionary works of antebellum America, the theological and theoretical tone for missions across denominational and interdenominational lines was set by the theology spawned by the NCMAPH. As soon as the initial reluctance was overcome, holiness encampments played a vital role in including missions in its agenda, recruiting missionaries from a number of traditionally non-holiness educational institutions, nurturing international missionary spokespersons, and using missions as its revivalist outlet. This process was further enhanced within the Wesleyan camp meeting circles where holiness was a crucial part of their statements of faith and, thus, became a mandatory experience for the missionaries, became a new theological rationale for missions, and provided a basis for the formation of a distinctive holiness missionary discourse about those living in "darkness" such as Africa.

---

[18] For the Church of the Nazarene and the Christian and Missionary Alliance see Carl Bangs, *Phineas F. Bresee: His Life in Methodism, the Holiness Movement and the Church of the Nazarene* (Kansas City: Beacon Hill, 1995); the Friends Africa Industrial Mission, the National Holiness Missionary Society (since 1954 known as the World Gospel Mission), and the Africa Inland Mission are mentioned by Burnett and Gerald Fish, *The Place of Songs: A History of the World Gospel Mission and the Africa Gospel Church in Kenya* (Kericho, Kenya: World Gospel Mission, 1989); also by Laura Trachsel, *Kindled Fires in Africa* (Marion: World Gospel Mission, 1960). The World Gospel Mission (WGM) and the Peniel Mission merged their ministries and boards of trustees in 1954. The ministries of the Peniel Missions at Stockton, California, continue to date under the sponsorship of WGM.